Indigenous peoples of South Africa: Current trends

Project for the Rights of Indigenous and Tribal Peoples

October 1999

International Labour Office Geneva
Indigenous peoples of South Africa: Current trends

Project for the Rights of Indigenous and Tribal Peoples

October 1999
The Project for the Promotion of ILO Policy on Indigenous and Tribal Peoples was established in 1996, with the specific objective of promoting general awareness of the ILO’s work on indigenous and tribal peoples. It aims to encourage the application of relevant standards in this respect, particularly the ILO’s Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (No. 169), thus enhancing dialogue between governments and indigenous and tribal peoples, and increasing the capacity of those peoples to participate in and take responsibility for development processes directly affecting them.

The South African Constitution of 1996 is premised on the equality of all citizens of South Africa. It indicates a governmental policy which is in many ways diametrically opposed to those of a previous era during which legalized racial discrimination permeated all aspects of South African life. Among the most vulnerable and impoverished groups in South Africa are the Khoi San, on which the Project has focused its work in South Africa. The San have faced a multiplicity of social and economic problems, which have worsened in recent years due to increasing competition from governments and multinational companies for land which was formerly occupied and managed by the San. This has resulted in a disruption of traditional economies and has had a drastic effect on the health and nutrition of the San. These problems are compounded by the detrimental impact of the apartheid regime on the cultural identity of the San and their ability to take part in the educational system.

The Project has collaborated with the South African San Institute (SASI) and the Indigenous Peoples of Africa Co-ordinating Committee (IPACC) to produce this publication. It is hoped that the provision of valuable demographic, cultural and economic information will form a basis for a national project which will be aimed at improving the socio-economic situation of indigenous peoples in South Africa as well as contributing towards their capability to defend their rights and cultures. It will also provide the South African Government with a valuable tool with which to address the national situation.

Until now, the Project has been involved in capacity building to enable local management of projects, and the promotion of gender awareness and land rights, among other issues in South Africa. In 1998, the Project, in collaboration with the ILO Area Office in Pretoria and the Department for Constitutional Development of the Government of South Africa, hosted a conference on the Constitutional Accommodation of Vulnerable Indigenous Communities in South Africa. An important outcome of this conference was a resolution, accepted by the South African Government, to give full effect to the provisions in the 1996 Constitution that relate to issues such as equality, citizens’ rights and the rights of indigenous peoples.

Future initiatives in this respect are presently being discussed, and involvement in research within the framework of the South African Government’s Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) is currently under consideration. The RDP, in collaboration with the Danish Transitional Assistance Programme in South Africa, places its focus on the development of democratic institutions, education and land reform and conflict resolution and mediation initiatives, with which the Project hopes to collaborate in the future.

Lee Swepston,
Chief,
Equality and Human Rights
Coordination Branch.

Henriette Rasmussen,
Chief Technical Adviser,
Project for the Rights of Indigenous and Tribal Peoples.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgement</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronyms</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Methodology</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes from the author</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. A note on spelling conventions</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Who is indigenous in South Africa?</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. What archaeologists and anthropologists have to say</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Groups currently identifying themselves as indigenous</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San (by ethnic group)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nama (Khoekhoen)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Griqua and !Koranna</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured, Baster, and revivalist Khoesan</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AmaMpondomise and Baroa</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaners</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of problems hindering socio-economic and cultural survival of</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>indigenous South Africans</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. The impact of the disruption of traditional economies and loss of</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>natural resource access</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1. Impact on health and nutrition:</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2. Impact on work and skills:</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. The impact of apartheid and colonial policies of ethnocide and</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assimilation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1. Impact on identity</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2. Impact of education</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3. Secondary impact of educational problems</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Socio-political problems</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4. Institutional weakness</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5. Gender issues</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1. Domestic violence and substance abuse</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Constitutional and legal concerns of indigenous South Africans</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and the response of government departments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Constitutional issues</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1. Language rights</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.1.2. Traditional leadership and indigenous law

4.2. Legal rights and needs
4.2.1. Land, water and natural resource rights
4.2.2. Intellectual property rights and contracting capacity

4.3. Summary of government performance

Agriculture and land affairs
Constitutional development and provincial affairs
National education
Environment and tourism
Finance: SA Statistics
Foreign affairs
Health
Justice
Water affairs and forestry
Welfare

5. Economic development and cultural survival: Friends or foe?
5.1. The 40-hour week versus flexible employment
5.1.1. Arts versus crafts
5.2. Cultural survival

6. Summary of solutions proposed by Nama and San indigenous peoples
6.1. Combine economic priorities with cultural resources
6.1.1. An indigenous development paradigm
6.2. Build institutional capacity
6.3. Include gender awareness in development
6.4. Promote empowerment through education

7. Recommendations
7.1. Educate and train government officials
7.2. Monitor intergovernmental cooperation and policy coherence
7.3. Advocate for a statistical baseline
7.4. Build institutional capacity
7.5. Promote international dialogue on economic development and cultural survival

Appendix A. Interviewees and consultations
Appendix B. Some comparative education indicators
Appendix C. Khoe and San languages spoken
Appendix D. Resolution: Conference held on 23 and 24 May 1998
Images of contemporary San Life ........................................ 43

Maps .................................................................................. 45

Research and bibliography .................................................... 46

We are happy to share this information with others interested in the future and hope it will be widely used.
Acknowledgement

The ILO Project for the Rights of Indigenous and Tribal Peoples would like to acknowledge the help of socio-linguist Mr. Nigel Crawhall for his work on this report, and also thanks the Indigenous Peoples of the Africa Coordinating Committee and the South African San Institute, for "lending out" Nigel to do this research. He has, after much travel and thanks to his linguistic ability and the trust he has built up with many of the indigenous South Africans, acquired an insight into the hearts of the people. He also has been able to provide here information about the San/Nama tribe, which was never available before.

We are happy to share this information with others interested in the issue, and hope it will be widely used.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronyms</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFNP</td>
<td>Augrabies Falls National Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIDS</td>
<td>Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCHDC</td>
<td>Cape Cultural Heritage Development Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPA</td>
<td>Communal Property Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSS</td>
<td>Central Statistics Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DACST</td>
<td>Department of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCD</td>
<td>Department of Constitutional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFA</td>
<td>Department of Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DLA</td>
<td>Department of Land Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DNE</td>
<td>Department of National Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNC</td>
<td>Griqua National Conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNF</td>
<td>Griqua National Forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>Human Immuno-Deficiency Virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization (and Office)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPACC</td>
<td>Indigenous Peoples of Africa Co-ordinating Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KGNP</td>
<td>Kalahari Gemsbok National Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KRC</td>
<td>Khoisan Representative Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LANGTAG</td>
<td>Language Plan Task Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LRC</td>
<td>Legal Resources Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NLP</td>
<td>National Language Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PanSALB</td>
<td>Pan South African Language Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RNP</td>
<td>Richtersveld National Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSA</td>
<td>Republic of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>South African</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern African Development Conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADF</td>
<td>South African Defence Force (old regime)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANDF</td>
<td>South African National Defence Force (current)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANP</td>
<td>South African National Parks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SASI</td>
<td>South African San Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TNP</td>
<td>Tsitsikamma National Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNWGIP</td>
<td>UN Working Group on Indigenous Populations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WIMSA</td>
<td>Working Group of Indigenous Minorities in Southern Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WIPO</td>
<td>World Intellectual Property Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Methodology

Notes from the author

Owing to time and resource constraints the report deals primarily with the situation of the more traditional Nama and San indigenous communities. Of those groups identifying themselves as indigenous in South Africa, Nama and San groups are distinguished by their cultural continuity with original hunter-gatherer and pastoralist cultures. This continuity is expressed through the continued use of Khoe and San languages, maintenance of elements of traditional economies (hunting-gathering, pastoralism), continued use of traditional customs (womanhood rituals, dances, dress), and evidence of unique indigenous knowledge (tracking skills, intensive knowledge of wild foods, bush skills, traditional medicines).

The report does not include detailed information about assimilated and urbanized populations. The Department of Constitutional Development (DCD) has worked with Griqua communities to gather information about their constituencies who are in both urban and rural areas and in relative degrees of assimilation. A new research initiative by DCD will with all groups claiming indigenous status to clarify their constituencies and historical claims. This research work includes the revivalist Khoe movement in urban areas.

Many of the practical needs of culturally assimilated people differ little from average South Africans, with the exception of the need to recognize self-proclaimed identities.

The terms of reference for the research posed a difficult task due to the lack of recorded information and statistics relating to indigenous peoples in South Africa. From 1955 until the demise of apartheid in 1994 the very presence of indigenous peoples was denied and they did not feature in any collection of statistics or economic surveys. Key identity indicators such as languages or self-identification were specifically not recorded.

Since the end of apartheid the race and ethnicity of people is no longer recorded on identity documents. The Central Statistics Service (now Statistics South Africa) in Kimberley confirmed in March 1999 that it has no record of the number of Griqua, Nama or San people in the Northern Cape. This is testament to the enduring impact of apartheid ideology.

The absence of statistics does not permit any serious cross community analysis of key variables such as birth and death rates, health care, literacy and language fluency, access to clean water, etc.

The statistics that do occur in the report are from the only quantitative analysis conducted amongst indigenous peoples, a report on the !Xů and Khwe of Schmidtsdrift prepared by Fiona Archer of Participatory Research cc for the Minister of Land Affairs in 1995 (see in particular Appendix B). There are also some statistics on Ṣhomani community numbers as recorded by a joint registration project of the South African San Institute (SASI) and Philippa Haden of the Department for International Development (DFID) and the Department of Land Affairs (DLA) in 1997-98.

Statistics on Nama people are based on consultations held by the report’s author. The figures for the Griqua come from estimates by the spokesperson for the Griqua National Conference, Cecil LeFleur.

The scope of the research did not permit a serious investigation at community level into the needs, circumstances and views of most indigenous people. Most of the communities are located

---

1 Apartheid, meaning “separateness” in Afrikaans, was the policy of the white minority Government to remove political power from the majority population based on theories of racial inferiority. The white minority controlled where black people were allowed to live and work, using the black majority as a subservient labour pool. San and Khoe people were not recognized under apartheid.
in rural areas, far away from each other, making visits an expensive exercise. Much of this work should still be undertaken at a future date (see Recommendations).

Instead the work has relied on interviews with indigenous leaders, individuals in communities, and people working for supporting agencies. These are supplemented by the results of recent workshops and consultations dealing with related themes (see Appendix A).

Individuals interviewed were for the most part known to the author and are actively involved in development and institution building in their communities. All of those participating in workshops were previously selected through democratic processes in their own communities and carried some form of mandate to represent the communities.

To balance the gap between the perceptions of leaders and those on the ground, several interviews were conducted with ordinary people with no mandate or position in the community. Here attention was given to working with people who are evidently at the bottom of the economic ladder.

The author himself has worked for three years on indigenous issues in South Africa and has conducted consultations with Nama and San communities in over half of their settlements. Experience from these previous consultations has also been included where relevant. Though original research material is scarce a survey of existing literature supplemented the original research and consultations (see Bibliography).

The research relies on anecdotal evidence and draws prima facie conclusions about trends and comparisons. These observations and perceptions should be further investigated before being considered fully accurate. They are intended to give a broad sense of the needs, contradictions and solutions experienced and proposed by indigenous peoples. Some margin of error is likely with such a general process and the author apologizes in advance for any such inaccuracies.

This report is to be translated into Afrikaans and distributed to participating communities for comment and consideration. The author extends his profound thanks to those people who made their time available to answer questions and give inputs.

1.1. A note on spelling conventions

Khoesan languages are distinguished by their unique inventory of consonants involving a clicking sound of the tongue against various parts of the mouth. These can be represented in a number of ways. Here I have used standard Nama orthography for Nama words, and an adapted version of the Ju/'hoan spelling system for Khwedam, !Xu and N/u words. Clicks are represented as r, l/, / and ǂ, being the alveopalatal, lateral, dental and palatal clicks respectively (after Prof. A. Traill, University of the Witwatersrand).

I have used the Nama spelling of the word Khoe, rather than the English spelling Khoi. The word is pronounced so it rhymes with buoy. San may also be written Saan, and is pronounced with a long "a".

No Khoe or San place names have official recognition in South Africa. I have thus included them in brackets to emphasize that indigenous people have their own place names and continue to be discriminated against by the State in this regard. Examples include the Orange (!Garib) River and the village of Khubus (!Gupus).

Nigel Crawhall
2. Who is indigenous in South Africa?

Though South Africans have always been aware that the San were the aboriginal population of the region, it has only been since the emergence of a democratic form of government during the 1990s that groups of people have started to lay claim to this status. Notably, aboriginal San form only a small percentage of those currently claiming the status of indigenous peoples. The popularity of claiming an indigenous identity has been influenced by a number of factors, including the increased awareness of the UN’s Decade of the World’s Indigenous People and the emergence of a more open and democratic society in South Africa whereby previously marginalized voices are being heard.

There is at present, no accepted South African norm as to the meaning of indigenous. The term appears twice in the Constitution (articles 6 and 26). Familiarity with South African political discourse suggests that “indigenous” as it is used in the Constitution refers to the languages and legal customs of majority Bantu-language speakers in contrast to those of the minority European settler populations.¹

This meaning is the norm in southern Africa where both Botswana and Zimbabwe regularly use the term indigenous to distinguish the black majority from the European and Asian settler minorities. However, in this report the term indigenous is used in the sense developed by the United Nations Working Group on Indigenous Populations (UNWGIP) to identify non-dominant groups of aboriginal or prior descent with distinct territorial and cultural identities. In Africa, most of these groups are pastoralists or hunter-gatherers, such as the Pygmies, Hadzabe, Maasai and Tuareg.

A pattern established within certain African countries by colonialists was to marginalize indigenous peoples in order to integrate agriculturalists into the economic and political system. This pattern of exclusion of culturally and economically distinct populations has been carried over into the post-independence area so that pastoralists and hunter-gatherers find themselves outside the political system. The new South Africa regime has instituted a radical departure from this pattern as it is actively engaging in a process of accommodating indigenous Khoe and San peoples into the constitutional and legal framework of the country.

Up until 1998, Khoe and San peoples did not have a place in South African political discourse. Under apartheid, the system of legalized racial discrimination, Khoe and San people were invisible, being forced to accept the racial category of coloured.

The current negotiations between the Department of Constitutional Development (DCD) and Griqua, Nama and San communities suggests that the South African Government is willing to review the legal meaning of the term indigenous to fit more precisely with UN and International Labour Organization (ILO) usage.

The South African Government’s caution about recognizing the UN definition is not as a result of a prejudice against aboriginal populations, as is common in other parts of Africa and the world. Rather, there is a sensitivity about triggering separatist movements by larger constituencies and promoting the principle of ethnic territoriality in a State that has just escaped the tyranny of minority apartheid rule that exploited that very principle.

There may well emerge two parallel definitions of the term indigenous, the one broadly referring to all South Africans of African ancestry, the other referring to specific populations using the UN definition and making specific territorial and cultural claims against the State. The boundaries of these emerging definitions have yet to be agreed.

¹ 76.7 per cent of South Africans are considered to be African (i.e. of Bantu-language speaking origin). Whites of European descent are 10.9 per cent, coloured people are 8.9 per cent and Indians 2.6 per cent (Statistics SA, 1998). The word Bantu is not universally acceptable in South Africa due to its association with apartheid. Here it is used to identify language groups only.
The DCD process acknowledges five types of constituencies to be researched in order to clarify their membership and claims. These are Griqua, Nama, San, !Koranna and the Cape Cultural Heritage Development Council (CCHDC). Some of these groups may not pass an authenticity test of representing coherent communities with continuous cultural traditions. There may also be further claims by other coloured and Xhosa constituencies to participate in the DCD process.

2.1. What archaeologists and anthropologists have to say

Archaeologists tell us that there is no debate about the genetic and material cultural identities of southern Africa's aboriginal population. The first South African human (Homo sapiens) population appears to date from around 150,000 years ago. From these people emerged a later Stone Age hunter-gatherer culture recognisable as San from about 25,000 and 15,000 years ago (Deacon et al., 1999: 92-93, 129).

The entire aboriginal population of Southern Africa descended from one stock known as Khoisan (later known as Khoesan).1 Out of this genetic pool emerged distinct cultures and economies. As with all human identities, these aboriginal identities, economies and cultures went through changes, merging and separating in response to environmental factors. Archaeologists and anthropologists tend to make a macro distinction between San populations on the one hand, whom they associate with hunter-gatherer economies and Khoekhoe populations on the other hand, associated with sheep and cattle pastoralism (Boonzaier et al., 1996).

Linguistically, the Khoesan world can be divided into three major families of languages and a few isolated varieties that show no evident relationship to each other apart from the distinctive click consonants (see Sands, 1995). These three language families are Southern (mostly of the !Kwi sub-branch), Central (Khoe), and Northern (Ju). The Khoesan family names in parentheses reflect the common word for a person in that cluster of languages (after Traill).

Currently, some speakers of Central Khoe languages identify themselves as Khoekhoe pastoralists, whereas others claim a San identity and others still claim a non-San hunter-gatherer identity (e.g. the Damara of Namibia). This suggests that the boundary between being Khoi or San is not necessarily fixed, and the boundaries between Khoe, San and other groups are not always evident.

The aboriginal population of South Africa appears to have been entirely composed of Southern San language speakers. According to archaeologists, Khoekhoe pastoralists entered South Africa from Botswana and Namibia fairly recently, approximately 2000 years ago (Deacon et al., 1999; Boonzaier et al., 1996).

In contrast, Bantu-speaking pastoralists and agriculturalists moved into the region between 1,800 to 800 years ago. They migrated down from east and central Africa, with a possible origin in west Africa (see Bohanan et al., 1971: 216-221; Bailey, 1995: 41-42). European settlers arrived after 1652, followed by south-east Asians and south Asians, many of whom came as slaves, prisoners or indentured labourers for the colonial regime. In 1652 there were between 100,000 and 200,000 speakers of Khoe (i.e. Central Khoesan) languages in South Africa, and approximately 20,000 speakers of Southern San languages (Traill, 1995: 3).

Between 1652 and the start of the nineteenth century there was a type of holocaust which drastically reduced the number of Khoi and San people. The European invasion of Khoekhoe lands and the subsequent impact this had in the interior of the country triggered a type of holocaust for indigenous peoples. The genocide, conducted by settlers and their proxies, included

1 The shift from Khoi to Khoe acknowledges standard Nama spelling.
violence ranging from murders to military conflicts with armed and organized indigenous peoples. More devastating than the direct violence was the introduction of European diseases, including smallpox, and also poverty caused by land loss.

Of those people surviving the holocaust, most assimilated into coloured (Afrikaans-speaking), Xhosa, Zulu, Swazi, Sotho, Phuthi and Tswana cultures.

The immense impact of colonial economic and physical force on the indigenous population of the Cape caused people to abandon their languages and much of their traditional culture and knowledge. Groups like the !Gonakhoe emerged on the frontier between Khoe and Xhosa cultures (Boonzaier et al., 1995: 88-89; also Traill, 1995: 3). These groups later integrated into both “coloured” and Xhosa identities.

This fracturing and regrouping process has left shards of identity scattered across the ethnic landscape of the country. Descendants have returned at various times to reclaim or examine these shards, be they genetic or cultural. Below is a historical review of the different contemporary groups claiming or discussing their indigenous identity. The review progresses from the groups who have the strongest continuity of identity to those for whom indigenous identity is being triggered by recent considerations and who have maintained another identity up until the process of revision.

2.2. Groups currently identifying themselves as indigenous

San (by ethnic group)

Both Government and the general public tend to refer to the various San groups as if they are one ethnic group. In fact, they are highly diverse, speaking different languages and with different cultural practices and levels of economic development.

!Xù and Khwe

Demographics: Today, the two largest San groups in South Africa are immigrants from Angola via Namibia. These are the !Xù and the Khwe, currently living at Schmidtsdrift, 80 km outside the provincial capital Kimberley. There are 3,500 !Xù and 1,100 Khwe. Both groups claim an indigenous identity on the basis of their languages and cultures. Owing to the close associations with military infrastructure, the communities have higher than average health care standards and basic adult literacy in Afrikaans.

Institutions: With NGO support, both communities have created elected tribal councils. Each council executive also serves on the Communal Property Association, a legal body that represents the communities’ interest in the current land claim. The Association is a form of joint governance for the two groups who do not always have the same views. Both groups participate in the United Nations Working Group on Indigenous Populations (UNWGIP) in Geneva. The Khwe belong to the Working Group of Indigenous Minorities in Southern Africa (WIMSA). Both !Xù and Khwe receive development support from the South African San Institute (SASI).

Other institutions include the Dutch Reformed Church and the school governance committee. There is also a network of traditional healers who are not part of formal institutions. There is an acknowledged Khwe traditional leader who belongs to formal structures. Traditional leadership in the !Xù community is still disputed, with six families claiming the status.

Land tenure and subsistence economy: After having been moved from Angola and Namibia by the SA Defence Force (SADF), the !Xù and Khwe were promised land at the military base of Schmidtsdrift. There was a counter-claim by the original inhabitants so after much political interference, the !Xù and Khwe were awarded new land at Plattfontein outside Kimberley. This land is much better than Schmidtsdrift and will provide a better base for development. The land will be owned collectively and administered by the Association. There is very little traditional subsistence activity due to the limitation of the new settlement location.
Khomani, /'Auni, Saasi

Demographics: The next largest group, the Khomani, constitutes one of the last surviving aboriginal South African San. Approximately 500 adults are spread over an area of more than 1,000 km in the Northern Cape province. Their densest settlements are at Rietfontein and surrounding villages, at Welkom (not the one in the Free State) near the Kalahari Gemsbok National Park (KGNP), in Upington townships and at a tourist resort in the Cedarberg of the Western Cape [recently this has been abandoned NC]. The majority of the community speaks Nama (Khoekhoegowap) as its home language. The entire community speaks Afrikaans, some as a first language, some as a second language. An estimated 30 people in this community speak the last surviving language of the Southern San peoples, known as N/u. Fifteen people have been positively identified and the rest are being sought. Amongst the older people there is some difference of opinion as to their ethnony (ethnic name). Terms used include Khomani, /'Auni, Saasi and //Ngi:kui (/Guna Rooi, Elsie Vaalbooi, Jan Jantjies, personal communications). These may reflect family or other clusters within a language and cultural zone. Literacy levels are very low, particularly in rural areas and amongst adults.

Institutions: The community is institutionally weak. The firmest institution is the extended family. With NGO support the Khomani have formed a democratically elected Communal Property Association (CPA) to handle the land claim against the Kalahari Gemsbok National Park (KGNP). There is one widely acknowledged traditional leader whose powers are undefined. The system of traditional healers has partially broken down. The Khomani are represented on the WIMSA Board and participate in the UNWGIP in Geneva. The Khomani receive support from SASI.

Land tenure and subsistence economy: Very few if any Khomani San have ever owned land. On 21 March 1999, the South African Government signed a land restitution deal with the CPA for 25,000 hectares inside Kalahari Gemsbok National Park, and 40,000 hectares outside the KGNP for farming, subsistence economic practices and other development. The core community group still conducts traditional hunting (only small game) and gathering though this has been severely constrained by landlessness.

//Xegwi

Demographics: A small pocket of aboriginal South African San lives on farms in Mpumalanga province near Lakes Banager and Chrissie, plus in and around the towns of Lothair and Carolina. Their numbers are not known, though estimates run between 30 and 100 adults. These /Xegwi San are descendants of a displaced group of Drakensberg San, famous for the rock paintings made by their ancestors up until the middle of the last century. Their original language is extinct (Frans Prins, personal communication).

Institutions: The only institutions are family and some adherence to local churches.

Land tenure and subsistence economy: None of the community owns land, they are mostly labour tenants on farms. There is a small amount of subsistence gathering, particularly for medicinal plants.

!Kung

Demographics: There is a group of about 70 adult !Kung San living across the border from South Africa at Masetleng and Ngwaatle Pans, Botswana. These people originally lived next to the Khomani in what became the Kalahari Gemsbok National Park (KGNP). They were displaced by the KGNP and driven into Botswana. They have lodged a land claim in South Africa though they have yet to resolve the issue of their citizenship. !Kung is a Northern San language.

According to Robert Waldron, Masetleng Pan “is a non-perennial pan and they are dependent for their water supplies on the government water truck. A small clinic is run by the Remote Area Dwellers Association. The community currently holds limited hunting rights in the area.”
Institutions: There are no formal institutions. According to Waldron: “The community consists of a mixture of !Kung-speaking bushmen, Bakgalagkadi and a small number of Setswana speakers. The !Kung form the core of this community and a Bushman, 'uku'e Nai [sic], acts as the 'Kaptein' of the community” (from Waldron, 1998).

Land tenure and subsistence economy: Most of this information is not currently known. Of all the South African indigenous peoples, the displaced !Kung are likely the poorest and most vulnerable.

/Xam descendants

There are thousands of people in the Northern Cape who are to some degree aware that they are direct descendants of the largest South African San population of the eighteenth and nineteenth century, the /Xam. In the area of Prieska there are semi-nomadic farm labourers known as Karretjie Mense or Swerwers (cart people or wanderers). These people know they are of San descent and may have spoken San languages in the previous century (See Traill, 1996).

Recently, the Khoisan Representative Council has attempted to claim responsibility for /Xam representation. It is unclear at this stage if there are any coherent community structures that have maintained a /Xam identity or whether this is a form of revisionism.

Table 1. Current San civil society organizations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Chairperson or spokesperson</th>
<th>Approximate numbers</th>
<th>Settlements, Provinces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>!Xu Council and !Xu and Khwe Communal Property Association</td>
<td>Mario Mahongo</td>
<td>3 500</td>
<td>Schmidtsdrift, Northern Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khwe Council and !Xu and Khwe Communal Property Association</td>
<td>Robert De Renge</td>
<td>1 100</td>
<td>Schmidtsdrift, Northern Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>!Khomani Communal Property Association</td>
<td>Petrus N/e De Renge</td>
<td>250-400</td>
<td>Rietfontein and Gordonia district, Northern Cape, Kagga Kamma, Western Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>!Xegwi, no structure</td>
<td>Simon Segudu, spokesperson</td>
<td>30 adults, there may be others</td>
<td>Lothair/Lake Chrissie area, Mpumalanga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>!Kung, no structure at present</td>
<td>/Uku'e Nai, spokesperson</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>Ngwaatle and Masetleng Pans, Botswana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/Xam, no structure</td>
<td>None, claims by Khoesan Representative Council</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Hopetown, Prieska, Colesberg, Brandvlei, Calvinia, Kenhardt</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Nama (Khoekhoen)

Demographics: There are approximately five to ten thousand Nama-speaking people living in the Northern Cape, particularly in the northern Namaqualand area, Bushmanland along the Orange (!Garib) River into the Gordonia and Kuruman districts.
Nama is the only surviving Khoe language in South Africa. The word Khoe means a person. In their own language the Nama refer to themselves as Khoekhoen. Along with the language is a rich indigenous knowledge system. With the 1955 apartheid legislation all Khoe and San people were reclassified as coloured. This legislation was accompanied by an aggressive campaign of assimilation whereby Nama-speaking children were beaten for even acknowledging their identity or using their language. An Afrikaans, Christian, coloured identity was enforced by both church and State. Literacy levels are low amongst adults. Access to health care facilities and adequate education is below average for the province.

Only people in the remotest regions were able to maintain their language and identity. Up until 1994, the Government of South Africa was not aware of the presence of Nama-speaking people inside the Republic.

Institutions: Most Nama people are not part of civil society structures that acknowledge their indigenous identities. Those groups involved in land claims belong to CPAs that include non-Nama people. Nama people tend to be dominated in shared institutional structures due to the stigma of their identity. The most influential institution is usually the church. There are no over-arching Nama structures. The work of IPACC and SASI and the consultation process with DCD is stimulating the formation of representative structures.

Land tenure and subsistence economy: In rural areas, particularly the Richtersveld, communities have managed to maintain communal land for grazing. This extends into the Richtersveld National Park. Some people are able to conduct limited hunting and plant gathering.

### Table 2. Current Nama civil society organizations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Chairperson or spokesperson</th>
<th>Approximate numbers</th>
<th>Settlements, Provinces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nama Representative Council</td>
<td>Simon Fredericks and Paul de Wet</td>
<td>2 500 in community</td>
<td>Khubus, Richtersveld, Northern Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanddrift</td>
<td>Jacob Fredericks</td>
<td>700 in community</td>
<td>Sanddrift, Richtersveld</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nama Representative Council, Steinkopf</td>
<td>Deborah Cloete, Colin Young</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Steinkopf, Northern Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riemvasmaak Nama cultural committee</td>
<td>Willem Damarah, Cecilia Mapanka</td>
<td>1 000 in community?</td>
<td>Riemvasmaak, Northern Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pella Nama cultural committee</td>
<td>Johannes April, Agatha Rienaar</td>
<td>400 in community</td>
<td>Pella, Northern Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underrepresented Nama settlements</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Unknown, up to 5 000</td>
<td>Lekkerling, Port Nolloth, Springbok, Bergsig, Vloosdrift, Matjieskloof, Henkries, Goodhouse, Pella Drift, Witbank, Pofadder, Kakamas, Keimoes, Upington and surrounding townships, Rietfontein and Kalahari towns, Olifantshoek, all in the Northern Cape</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 In the late nineteenth century there were three KhoeKhoe languages still being spoken in South Africa, namely Xiri (of the northern Griqua), !Ora (of the northern !Korana) and Nama spoken widely across the western regions of the Northern Cape.
Griqua and !Koranna

**Demographics:** There are approximately 300,000 Griquas in South Africa. Their economic, educational and health care situations vary greatly, ranging from impoverished rural farm labour tenants, to middle-class urban dwellers.

Griqua identity emerged in the late eighteenth century when landless Khoe began to cluster around European churches in search of land and protection from settlers. The identity was consolidated after 1830 when European churches accepted that indigenous and local Africans could be baptized. By this time they had already lost their original languages and many of their cultural practices and traditional knowledge.

Though many Griquas have genetic ties to European settlers, unlike coloured and Baster groups, the Griquas are explicit that their heritage is African and Khoe. In the Northern Cape, the Griqua situation is more complex than in the south because there were some Griquas who were part of the Khoekhoe who survived linguistically and culturally on the edges of the colony well into the nineteenth century. These people lived in the Kimberley and Griqualand West area of what is now the Northern Cape until the end of the nineteenth century when they too took Afrikaans as their first language and began to shift away from pastoralism and the traditional economy.

Similarly, the !Ora (or !Korana) of the Upington and Orange River area held out against the colonial forces, maintaining their culture, language and identities. They fought several guerrilla wars against the colonial regime in the last century (see Strauss, 1979). They were eventually defeated resulting in a rapid decline of their language and identity. Today there is no broad movement of !Koranas, though there are revivalist movements claiming this identity within the DCD negotiation process.

**Institutions:** The southern Griquas formed the earliest civil society structures in South Africa and have been a leading force in the recognition of indigenous rights in the democratic era. About half of the Griqua population belongs to some or other community-based structure.

The Table below indicates the current Griqua civil society organizations and their approximate size and scope. All of these organizations are members of the Griqua National Forum, an alliance that was created in 1998 to negotiate with the Government of South Africa for recognition of their indigenous status.

**Table 3. Griqua organizations in the Griqua National Forum**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Leader</th>
<th>Approximate numbers</th>
<th>Provinces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Griqua National Conference (founded 1904)</td>
<td>AAS LeFleur II</td>
<td>50 000</td>
<td>Western Cape, Northern Cape, Eastern Cape, KwaZulu-Natal, Gauteng, Free State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pioneers council</td>
<td>Paul Pienaar</td>
<td>10 000</td>
<td>Eastern Cape, KwaZulu-Natal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Griqua volksorganisasie</td>
<td>Bishop Daniel Kanyiles</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Northern Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adam Kok V Griquas</td>
<td>Adam Kok V</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Northern Cape, Kimberley area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterboer Griquas</td>
<td>Andries Waterboer or JJ</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Griquatown West, Northern Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Griqua National Conference (second group)</td>
<td>Anthony LeFleur</td>
<td>1 000</td>
<td>Western Cape, Eastern Cape</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Cecil LeFleur, GNC. NB. The DCD research process should clarify the numbers of members of each community organization.
Land tenure and subsistence economy: Land tenure varies from individual title, to trust ownership to no title or land security. Several Griqua communities in the Northern Cape are participating in the land restitution and redistribution process. There is little if any subsistence hunting, gathering or pastoralism due to lack of land, however this topic warrants further investigation.

Coloured, Baster, and revivalist Khoesan

Demographics: There are some 3,600,000 South Africans who identify themselves as coloured (Statistics SA, 1998: section 2.5). The majority of these people do not consider themselves to be indigenous Khoe or San. The number of Basters is unknown. An estimate would put them at three to five thousand people. The number of revivalist Khoesan is unknown.

During the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries certain Khoe groups from the Cape Province rallied around European Protestant churches to provide them with resources and protection. Initially the European churches denied that indigenous Africans had souls. This led to the promotion of the identities based on true or imagined mixed African and European descent. Owing to such unions being unlawful, the offspring referred to themselves as Bastards. This Bastard identity was one of high status in the colonial system because it entitled the user to certain material rights reserved to people of European descent (Boonzaier et al., 1996: 131).

In 1830 the churches began to accept that Africans could be baptized. The Bastard (later Baster) identity became problematic due to its connotation of excluding recognized formal marriages. The Khoe descendant population forked in several directions. The majority took on a coloured identity. Coloured, as with Bastard, implied partial European lineage and as such brought with it certain rights, especially the all-important rights of land tenure.

Owing to increasing conflict with white settlers, some Bastards chose to maintain their identity and trekked out of the Cape toward Namibia in search of safer lands. These people spoke Nama (a Khoe language) and Afrikaans (the Khoe Dutch of the Cape), and practised pastoralism similar to other Khoekhoe people. Groups of Basters settled along the migration route, with a large settlement being established by Dirk Vilander in Mier district north of Upington, a traditionally San area.

Today there are several pockets of self-identified Basters in South Africa. Unlike their Namibian cousins, they have avoided becoming involved with the indigenous movement because of their historic commitment to their European identity and their rejection of Khoe and San culture as primitive.

Institutions: In the Western and Eastern Cape there have been moves by coloured South Africans to reclaim their historical identity. These moves have been influenced by the rise of Griqua identity in the post-apartheid period. A notable case of revivalism is the 1996 formation of the Cape Cultural Heritage Development Council (CCHDC). CCHDC, based in Cape Town and led by Joseph Little, has opened branches in the Southern and Eastern Cape areas, and aligned itself to Bishop Kanyiles of the Griqua Volksorganisasie. Initially CCHDC had projected various interpretations of its identity, most recently claiming to be Khoekhoe Chiefs of 12 southern tribes such as the extinct Goringhaiqua ("Urib"aekhoen) of the Cape Peninsula. According to most academic and community accounts these groups were assimilated into surrounding identities over the last three centuries.

A similar movement has started in the Kimberley area, known as the Khoisan Representative Council (KRC). KRC claims to represent a broad alliance of recently emerged indigenous identities including Khoe, Koranna, San and Griqua. According to public statements at the last round of constitutional negotiations, both CCHDC and KRC reject the use of the term coloured. CCHDC promotes the position that all coloured people are indigenous. The KRC has recently signed an alliance with the white Afrikaner separatist movement, the Freedom Front. Though this move is meant to intimidate the Government it more likely demonstrates how...
marginal KRC is to the indigenous movement that rejects racism and embraces the advantages of a democratic Constitution.

**Land tenure and subsistence economy:** This information is not known. Urban groups are more likely to have individual title or rental arrangements. Rural Basters are either landowners or labour tenants.

| Table 4. Baster, and revivalist Khoesan organizations |
|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Organization | Leader/spokesperson | Approximate numbers | Provinces |
| Baster volksorganisasie | Hendrick Bott | Unknown | Upington and Rietfontein, Northern Cape |
| Cape Cultural Heritage Development Council | Joseph Little | Unknown | Western Cape, Eastern Cape, Gauteng, Free State, Northern Cape |
| Khoisan Representative Council | Martin Engelbrecht | Unknown | Northern Cape |

**AmaMpondomise and Baroa**

**Demographics:** The demographic details of these groups are unknown at present.

One of the effects of the rapid integration of Khoe and San people into Nguni society was a monumental absorption of Khoe and San words into the Xhosa and Zulu languages, and with these came the distinctive clicks of San and Khoe languages (see Herbert, 1995). Recent research on Xhosa oral tradition shows a continuing awareness of the linguistic, intellectual and spiritual impact of San and Khoe culture on Xhosa culture (see Jolly 1996 and Prins 1996).

Currently, there are Xhosa groups, particularly the AmaMpondomise who are going through a revivalism about their links to the San and Khoe heritage. In various parts of the Eastern Cape, some Xhosa people are still identified as Abarwa, indicating an aboriginal origin. Also, along the Lesotho border area the Sotho and Phuthi which absorbed the Seroa Bushmen population, famous for their rock paintings and medicine, continue to identify certain people as Baroa, i.e. of San descent (see Prins, 1996).

**Institutions:** Groups are organized around traditional churches that include San religious traditions such as rainmaking. The Department of Arts, Culture and Education, Eastern Cape Province has shown a keen interest in opening up discussions of indigenous identity and history within the Xhosa-speaking world.

**Land tenure and subsistence economy:** Unknown at present.

**Afrikaners**

A note should be included about certain nationalist Afrikaners who are claiming an indigenous identity. In 1996, a group of Afrikaner nationalists attended the UNWGIP, claiming that they too are indigenous. Afrikaners are white South Africans of predominantly Dutch and French descent. They controlled the political system during the 40 years of apartheid during which time South Africa experienced extensive human and civil rights violations. This recent Afrikaner claim to indigenous identity emerges out of the belief that Afrikaner identity and language developed uniquely and distinctively in Africa, away from its origins in Europe. The UNWGIP ignored the delegation and the nationalists have not pursued this issue.

There are some issues raised by the Afrikaner nationalist involvement in the indigenous issue that bear reflection. Certain Afrikaner nationalists wish to create a separate ethnic State in
South Africa. They reject the principles of pluralist democracies and tolerance of diversity. This position is anathema to the Government of South Africa that is committed to principles of equality of all people in the Republic, and a bill of rights providing for protection by the State against discrimination on a broad range of themes.

The rejection of Afrikaner claims to indigenous status indicates that self-definition has limits. It raises questions also about certain coloured South Africans who claim an indigenous identity using much the same language as the Afrikaner nationalists, including an overt hostility toward a majority democratic Government.

This problem of definition highlights an area of anxiety for the Government, namely that the acknowledgement of indigenous rights, particularly the right to self-determination, may trigger a constitutional crisis amongst more privileged communities that wish to undermine the democratic regime.
3. Needs overview of South African indigenous peoples

Khomani activists asked the few elders who still speak their ancient language N/u for guidance on what restitution they should be asking from the Government. The answer was: !lhaa, //x'am, or Land, Water and Truth. /Guna Rooi, 70 year old Saasi woman, Upington.

It is hard to generalize about problems facing indigenous South Africans as their circumstances vary substantially. A point of departure is to recognize that Nama and San people, in particular, constitute some of the poorest of the poor in South Africa. This is a result of living in neglected rural areas, but moreover it is the result of their stigmatized status as a rural underclass, fit only for menial labour.

This poverty must be seen in the context of a society with tremendous imbalances of wealth and opportunities determined for the most part by a person’s skin colour, language and identity. The situation of Khoi and San peoples under apartheid has created a type of double jeopardy whereby they are discriminated against because of their identities, yet there is no institutionalized servicing of their needs as was the case of other ethnic groups identified by the apartheid regime's classificatory system.

Below is a summary of the problems facing indigenous peoples and an attempt to demonstrate the hierarchy and causality of barriers to economic development and cultural survival. As noted in the section on methodology attention is principally given to San and Nama groups who have maintained their languages and cultural continuity, and find themselves at great risk of losing these within the next generation.

Ouma/Guna’s words above manage to condense the complexity of needs. People need access to natural resources such as land and water (most South African indigenous people live in arid to semi-arid areas of the country). And along with this they need the truth of their situation, known by themselves and those they interact with. Ignorance and silence are the enemies of indigenous people. The new dispensation brings fresh opportunities to indigenous people. However, economic development needs to reestablish the truth, dignity and self-respect of the people through the revitalization of languages, cultures and traditional knowledge systems.

Summary of problems hindering socio-economic and cultural survival of indigenous South Africans

3.1. The impact of the disruption of traditional economies and loss of natural resource access

The root cause hindering economic development and intergenerational cultural survival has been the forced dispossession of traditional land that once formed the basis of hunter-gatherer and pastoralist economies and identities.

The successive dispossession of indigenous peoples was caused by white and coloured farmers using the force of colonial law to seize lands and disperse unwanted surplus people. Later on, more sophisticated economic ventures such as mining, the military and the national parks alienated what little land was left. Each of these ventures brought with it the support of the South African political and legal system.

A typical result of this dispossession was the criminalization of hunters. Animals became either the property of the State, or the individual farmer. Suddenly, feeding the family became a crime and all of the highly specialized economic skills developed over centuries were redundant and at risk.
This sudden dispossession of land and natural resources has caused indigenous people to plunge from a situation of self-reliance into poverty and a dependency on external resources.

3.1.1. Impact on health and nutrition

- Nutrition levels have dropped due to sedentarization and lack of access to traditional bush food. Communities used to eat fresh wild animal meat and plants high in vitamins and roughage. Now their diet consists primarily of low value foods such as bread, maize meal, tinned meat when available, sugar, coffee and tea.

- All respondents report a drop in health care and vitality due to poor nutrition and inadequate access to traditional or Western medicines. Where there is regular access to clinics, health care standards are higher.

- Inadequate access to clean water is a serious concern for a number of communities. One community outside Upington has to walk eight kilometres to the river to collect water. There are regular outbreaks of gastroenteritis in the Kalahari settlements and township settlements.

- There has been an evident impact on mental health due to substance abuse and frustration caused by poverty and dispossession. Mental health problems are particularly acute amongst !Xô and Khwe people who endured psychologically harmful conditions during the wars in Angola and Namibia.

There are no available figures for Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV) infection in indigenous communities. South Africa is experiencing a very rapid growth in HIV and AIDS. Infection rates are higher amongst women than men, and are higher in poorer communities than affluent communities. Typically, displaced communities and migrant labour are more susceptible to infection than stabilized communities with set routines and support systems. Owing to the small numbers of indigenous Khoe and San, and their economic and social situation, HIV and AIDS should be considered a serious threat. There are no serious AIDS prevention interventions oriented at indigenous populations.

3.1.2. Impact on work and skills

- People have been forced into barely sustainable levels of the cash economy where they work for minimal wages watching sheep or doing domestic work on farms where they have no tenure rights or job security. Some rely on poorly paid seasonal work, such as grape harvesting.

- In some cases, men have been able to secure better remunerated work in mines and the military, however this employment has been limited to relatively few people, and in the case of the mines the work is insecure.

- Traditional hunting, shepherding, animal husbandry and food gathering skills have decreased amongst the youngest generation due to alienation from natural resources.

1 The clinic at Schmidtsdrift reports only a few cases of HIV.
3.2. The impact of apartheid and colonial policies of ethnocide and assimilation

Throughout the period of colonialism, Khoe and San people were seen to be particularly barbaric and harmful. The State sanctioned a series of efforts to exterminate them and later to Christianize, dispossess them and stop nomadic movements.

Under apartheid, the State enforced a policy whereby all Khoe and San people who had not already been assimilated into other populations were forcibly registered as coloured. Failure to register was illegal and unavoidable. Most Khoe and San people describe this period as extraordinarily humiliating.

3.2.1. Impact on identity

- San and Nama elders were often forced to hide their identities, misrepresenting or hiding their identities from neighbours and sometimes even their own children.
- San people in particular were driven away from each other in an attempt to dissuade them from hunting or congregating on traditional lands. Languages died out rapidly as San sought refuge in more stable communities, including Nama, Griqua, coloured and Swazi people.
- A generation gap occurred wherein young people rejected their parents' and grandparents' identities and traditional knowledge as shameful and backwards.
- The loss of self-esteem caused by poverty, dispossession and loss of dignity has led to substantial problems of alcohol and drug abuse, which in turn contribute to domestic violence and neglect of children.
- Domestic violence and neglect have led to the weakening of families and social institutions which used to carry information from one generation to the next.
- Important social rituals that used to bind the communities together and ensure certain rights and obligations were banned or otherwise suppressed including: trance dancing, step-dancing, hunting feasts, women's first menstruation celebrations.

3.2.2. Impact of education

- Educational opportunities on farms were few and controlled by European or coloured farmers who considered indigenous customs to be primitive and the languages impossibly difficult.
- Khoe and San people tended to drop out of school early, either returning to the land or working at the bottom of the rural labour economy.
- Many San and Nama adults have had little or no access to formal education, illiteracy levels are high in official languages and there is almost no literacy at all in first languages.
- Where education has been available it has been psychologically harmful. State sponsored education under apartheid portrayed indigenous people as primitive and extinct. Christian
national education promoted total assimilation of indigenous peoples (though not of other black majority cultures).

- State policies were copied by churches which mostly promoted Afrikaans, coloured identities and forbade the use of indigenous languages or access to Nama language Bibles available in Namibia.
- Children using Khoe or San languages in state and church schools received corporal punishment and were forced to recant their identities.
- Traditional education was difficult or impossible to sustain where people have limited or no access to wild areas for tracking, gathering and hunting.
- Traditional customs of singing, dancing and storytelling have been discouraged by hostile employers, churches and landowners. Children have fewer practical traditional skills and less environmental knowledge than their parents or grandparents. Most rural Khoe and San children are being deskilled by the school system.

3.2.3. Secondary impact of educational problems

- Inadequate Afrikaans literacy levels exclude community members from pursuing educational and employment interests.
- In negotiations with South African National Parks (SANP) and work on wilderness research, low literacy levels are a distinct disadvantage and cause indigenous knowledge to be undervalued or rewarded.
- There is almost no Nama literacy and the language is not taught in South African schools (a poorly conceived pilot project is being introduced in one village).
- The ancient Khomani language, N/u, has no standardized alphabet system and most of its surviving speakers are over 60 years of age, thus less likely to grasp literacy skills. 50 per cent of the surviving speakers have yet to be located.
- Neither !Xó nor Khwedam have standardized alphabets making literacy initiatives particularly difficult.
- The stigma associated with the languages (particularly Nama) by young people require special attention by educators and policy-makers when introducing the languages to the curriculum.

3.3. Socio-political problems

The marginalization of San and Khoe people has been institutionalized by the State. This creates special problems in the new democratic dispensation because no one is responsible for indigenous matters. State departments do not recognize indigenous constituencies as distinct. State officials tend to be ignorant of the needs, cultures and conditions of indigenous peoples.

The only department to take this issue seriously is the Department of Constitutional Development (DCD). Other key departments such as education, arts and culture have no mechanisms or institutional receptors to deal with demands by indigenous peoples.

There is an urgent need for the Government to prepare state officials to cope with the special needs of indigenous peoples, and to coordinate policy between the various departments and state institutions (see the following chapter on legal and constitutional needs).

3.4. Institutional weakness

Indigenous groups have had a particularly difficult time advocating for their rights due to their very weak institutional capacity.
The oldest Griqua organization is over a century old. In contrast the oldest Nama organization is less than three years old and the oldest San organization is five years old. Even simple advocacy activities such as writing letters to the Pan South African Language Board (PanSALB) or the SA Geographical Names Council tend not to get done or followed up (according to SASI internal reports on advocacy training).

There is a marked capacity difference between San-controlled institutions which receive the support of a dedicated NGO, the South African San Institute (SASI), and the Nama institutions which have little or no external support. The presence of an NGO tends to increase community institutional capacity substantially.

San groups have been able to take full control of local institutions such as the Communal Property Association, whereas Nama groups are often marginalized by other ethnic groups in their local area.

NGOs currently working with indigenous groups include:
- South African San Institute (SASI): working with San groups in the Southern Kalahari and Schmidtsdrift/Plattfontein. Based in Cape Town.
- Legal Resources Centre: working with Nama groups in the Richtersveld and Riemvasmaak. Based in Cape Town;
- Surplus People Project: a land NGO working with Nama people along the Orange River, Richtersveld and Steinkopf. Based in Cape Town and Springbok.

3.5. Gender issues

If indigenous people make up some of the poorest of the poor in South Africa, it is not a surprise that indigenous women and children suffer the greatest burden of this poverty.

Kujandra Sikamba
32 years old, Khwe woman, Plattfontein

Kujandra earns R60 (US$9.50) a week in a job creation project at the new settlement of Plattfontein. She supports six children with no husband or additional income. Though she is quite unhappy with her current financial situation she enjoys doing the lino-cuts printing and the smaller watercolour paintings. The work gives her a sense of satisfaction. She feels that the project should give more attention to marketing the products. She would be willing to do some of the marketing herself if she could speak more Afrikaans and some English.

Traditionally, women had important roles to play in gathering and preparing food for the whole community. Men’s role as hunters was intermittent, so the status of women was significant in the daily survival of the community. In contrast to Bantu and European societies, San and Nama communities attribute female characteristics to good phenomena. For example, San distinguish between female rain (which is gentle and soaking, helping plants grow) and male rain (which is harsh and destructive) (in Deacon et al. 1996 as per Bleek collection). The single most important ritual in the San and Nama cultures is the celebration of a woman’s first menstruation. This time is marked by two-week seclusion in a traditional grass or reed-mat house, education from other women, and a dancing out ceremony attended by all local indigenous people.

During interviews, older San and Nama women expressed the concern that their roles have been reduced since entering into the cash economy. The process of dispossession and forced entry
into colonial and apartheid economies substantially weakened the position of women. Women worked as domestic labour in the farmhouse. This was a lowly and secondary position to their husbands and sons who were hired to watch after sheep. The men’s work had a higher status and was a more valuable type of labour that was not so easily replaced.

Men were also able to hunt small animals while working and could thus provide additional food for the family. Women could not travel far from the farmhouse, and though they gathered medicinal plants, they were unable to do serious food gathering.

Subjective observation suggests that women in more traditional situations (such as at Kagga Kamma and Welkom) enjoy a higher status relative to women in poor yet assimilated families in urban areas. This status is reversed again where young women, such as in Nama communities, have achieved a certain level of education and are able to move into new types of relations with men (e.g. women as school teachers, local councillors, shopkeepers).

Figure 1. Trends in gender-based labour value

Dominant economic pattern

Hunting/Gathering ↔ Assimilated Poor Labourers ↔ Upward mobility

Sharp labour division ↔ Sharp labour division ↔ Moderate labour division

Equality of decision-making ↔ Male labour valued, women’s labour ↔ Labour value is less power and influence ↔ of lesser and dependent value ↔ gender dependent

Relative status of gender relations

The figure above suggests that there is a serious need to factor in the status and dependency of women when promoting new economic opportunities amongst indigenous peoples. Labour that further assimilates people but does not offer compensation through education and opportunities serves to disproportionately benefit men over women.

3.5.1. Domestic violence and substance abuse

The other major area of concern for San and Khoe women is the unacceptably high level of domestic violence. Violence in some communities is so extreme that it includes murders and assaults with weapons. Violence is often associated with alcohol abuse and low self-esteem by men and women.

San and Khoe people are rarely in control of the distribution and profits gained from the sale of alcohol and drugs. Rather they are the desperate consumers and victims of exploitation by outsiders. Though indigenous people consume these products there is frequently anger and resentment toward those who bring them into the community and benefit financially at the expense of the indigenous people.
4. Constitutional and legal concerns of indigenous South Africans and the response of government departments

South Africa has recently left behind a period of legal discrimination based on race and a political system notorious for its regular violation of human and civil rights.

In a reaction to the horrors of the past and the nature of the particular liberation struggle, the new Constitution, completed in 1996, is premised on the equality of all people in the Republic and explicitly prevents discrimination on a broad range of criteria. Overall, the South African Constitution marks a new era in the global movement to secure human decency.

Khoe and San people are likely to benefit extensively from the contents of the Constitution and the accompanying legislation. However, some areas remain problematic, particularly the ability of indigenous people to access the mechanisms that are meant to guarantee the implementation of rights. The constitutional mechanisms require substantial resources on the part of claimant communities before they can test and ensure the implementation of a particular right. Impoverished, mostly illiterate populations living in townships or remote areas cannot hope to conduct the type of legal strategy successfully conducted by urban interest groups.

4.1. Constitutional issues

4.1.1. Language rights

When the South African Constitution was released in May 1996 it included the first ever constitutional reference to Khoe and San people:

Article 6(2). Recognizing the historically diminished use and status of the indigenous languages of our people, the State must take practical and positive measures to elevate the status and advance the use of these languages.

Article 6(5). A Pan South African Language Board established by national legislation must-

(a) promote and create conditions for the development and use of-

(ii) the Khoi, Nama and San languages.

Note that 6(2) uses indigenous in reference to the majority languages recognized under apartheid which became the 11 official languages of the Republic in 1994, i.e. not necessarily referring to the Khoe and San indigenous languages. Nonetheless article 6(5) has opened a whole new constitutional chapter by recognizing the presence of Khoe and San people and their endangered languages.

At the time the Constitution was released the National Language Project (NLP) and SASI cooperated to consult with Khoe and San communities to see if they were aware of the language clauses and their implications.

Since that time SASI has been involved in helping San and Khoe groups make applications and recommendations to the Pan South African Language Board (PanSALB). Despite professional assistance it is evident that San and Khoe groups cannot yet use clause 6(5)(ii) effectively to address their needs.

PanSALB has made it clear that it does not have the capacity to assist Khoe and San people other than through grant making. Grants can only be made where there is both the capacity to make applications and manage the responsibility of implementation. The conclusion is that only well resourced constituencies with access to researchers, linguists and project managers stand any hope of benefiting from articles 6(2) and 6(5). This is a serious indictment of the Constitution.

During 1999, PanSALB is due to establish the Khoe and San Language Body which will be an advisory body to the Government on language matters. This Body will consist only of speakers
of Khoe and San languages, and as such, will be the first legal governmental structure to give
indigenous people a direct voice in matters concerning their future.

Article 35 sets out the rights of arrested, detained and accused persons. These extensive
rights put the onus on the State to communicate its actions and ensure that the person concerned
understands the process and his/her rights. Article 35(4) states that: "Whenever this section
requires information to be given to a person that information must be given in a language that the
person understands" (RSA, 1996: 18).

This right is carried through to any correspondence of negative administrative action.
Currently, most representatives of the State, and courts in particular, ignore this
constitutional guarantee for Nama, !Xû and Khwedam speakers. There are no qualified
interpreters for any of these languages working for the Department of Justice. In recent court
cases over stock theft and unlawful crossing of the border by San people the magistrate made no
allowance for Afrikaans being an inferior language of both accused persons whose first language
is Nama.

Another example of the failure of the Constitution is the issue of place names. There is not
a single correct Khoe or San place name in the Northern Cape, despite this area having been
completely occupied by indigenous peoples right up until the end of the last century. The newly
reformed SA Geographical Names Council has rejected accusations of anti-indigenous bias
pointing out that no indigenous group made applications for name changes. It is a statement on
the current constitutional set up. If you do not have the infrastructure and sophistication to use
formal channels to ensure that rights are implemented, they are of little or no use to you.

4.1.2. Traditional leadership and indigenous law

Article 26(1)(b) on local government states:

A traditional leader of a community observing a system of indigenous law and residing on land within the area
of a transitional council, transitional rural council or transitional representative council, referred to in the Local
Government Transition Act, 1993, and who has been identified as set out in section 182 of the previous
Constitution, is ex officio entitled to be a member of that council until 30 April 1999 or until an Act of
Parliament provides otherwise. (Emphasis added.)

Up until the present, Khoe and San systems of governance and traditional leadership were
not recognized. In practice, the institutions of leadership have disintegrated under the onslaught
of colonialism then apartheid. Nonetheless some indigenous communities are interested in using
article 26(1)(b) or the replacement legislation to ensure a voice in local government.

The Department of Constitutional Development is giving serious consideration to creating
equity between Khoe, San and Bantu systems of traditional leadership representations.

4.2. Legal rights and needs

4.2.1. Land, water and natural resource rights

The most pressing concern of all the indigenous communities is securing their land base, and
where possible, reestablishing access to natural resources necessary for pastoralism,
hunting-gathering or new land-based ventures such as farming.

With the assistance of external non-governmental organizations, particularly SASI and the
Legal Resources Centre (LRC), indigenous groups have been surprisingly effective at using
legislation designed to restore or redistribute land alienated under racial legislation since 1913.
Considering that there was no legislation dealing explicitly with alienating land from Khoe and
San peoples on the basis of race, it is a sign of the flexibility of the current legislation that most
groups have shown some success with land claims.
Examples include: a successful land claim by !Xu and Khwe people who were displaced from Schmidtsdrift by a counter-claim; the recently settled land claim by !Khomani San in the Southern Kalahari which includes part of the Kalahari Gemsbok National Park; the resettlement of Nama people at Riemvasmaak; ongoing claims by Steinkopf and Richtersveld Namas, and resettlement projects in Goodhouse (Gudaus), Pella and Witbank. Griqua groups in the Northern Cape have also shown some success with land claims and redistribution projects, including the use of trust laws to gain collective land rights.

Not all of these processes deal explicitly with the indigenous identity of the claimants but the fact that this type of restoration is happening, and noting its rarity in the region, it is a positive sign.

There has been some effort by non-San people to promote the idea that cannabis (dagga) is the traditional tobacco of the Southern Kalahari San and should thus be decriminalized. This allegation has been strongly contested by elders who say the plant was only used medicinally and was not smoked. Though cannabis has substantially less damaging impact than alcohol or even extensive use of tobacco it serves to weaken the capacity of people to organize and represent themselves in important negotiations. It consumes economic resources that could be put to more effective uses.

4.2.2. Intellectual property rights and contracting capacity

A newly emerging area of rights, primarily driven by SASI's legal rights project, has been in the area of intellectual property rights and the capacity of communities to enter into collective contracts with outsiders.

San groups who find themselves regularly exploited by tourism, film and media projects have repeatedly stressed their need to improve their contracting power. During consultations with the World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO), intellectual property rights specialists emphasized that collective rights are only as good as the community based mechanisms to manage them. If one community member disposes of valuable intellectual property, it enters the public domain and is worthless to the rest of the community. None of the indigenous San or Khoe has community-based mechanisms to ensure the protection and management of intellectual property.

Roger Chennells, SASI's legal specialist makes the following point concerning patents:

Much traditional knowledge is patentable, but the expense involved, the collective ownership, and the potential difficulty of proving the novelty (i.e. that no other groups possess such knowledge) discourage the regular use of patents. Patent protection is appropriate when traditional knowledge is researched, and then commercially exploited in partnership with a commercial partner, such as a pharmaceutical firm. (Chennells, 1998.)

Again, rights are available in theory but not in practice. The communities do not have the resources and the institutional base to manage such rights and the mechanisms that accompany them.

4.3. Summary of government performance

A current report card of government departments' awareness and responses to the needs of indigenous Khoe and San people might look as follows (with A being ideal, and F being a negative result):
Table 5. Report card on government awareness and responses to indigenous needs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National Department</th>
<th>Awareness (including information gathering)</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Policy development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural and Land Affairs</td>
<td>B+</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts, Culture, Science and Technology</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional Development and Provincial Affairs</td>
<td>B+</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Tourism</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Finance) SA Statistics</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>B+</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justice</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Affairs</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welfare</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Cape Provincial Dept. Of Arts Culture and Education</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Agriculture and land affairs

The Minister of Land Affairs, Derek Hanekom has commissioned a series of investigations into the situation of San people. He has actively pursued a policy of redress for San and other rural people. He has directly encouraged settlement of the Schmidtsdrift and Southern Kalahari land claims. Though he has been actively involved in Nama issues, there appears to be less coherence in this approach. Nama cultural issues were not adequately considered in the land resettlement projects at Riemvasmaak (//Ou ǂaib) and Witbank (ǃHuirǃhaub). There is reluctance on the part of the Department to explore issues of policy regarding indigenous land and natural resource rights. This will likely only be guided by the findings of the DCD research.

Arts, culture, science and technology

In 1995, DACST commissioned the Language Plan Task Group (LANGTAG) to conduct a broad programme of research and consultation on the need for language policy and areas of rights violations. This report was the first government report that dealt with the needs of indigenous peoples. The report has subsequently been ignored. Up until 1999 there was no one responsible for Khoe and San liaison. There is no policy in place regarding indigenous peoples. DACST has not responded to the series of submissions made by indigenous peoples and SASI on language and cultural rights. Presidential pressure to include Khoe and San people in the Legacy Projects has stimulated more information gathering and process formation by DACST officials.

1 Only government departments affected directly by Khoe and San claims have been included here. Some departments and some ministers have been changed since the May 1999 elections.
Constitutional development and provincial affairs

DCD has distinguished itself by proactively engaging with Khoe and San communities. Following lobbying by Griqua groups and the ILO, the first Conference regarding the Constitutional Accommodation of Vulnerable Indigenous Communities in South Africa was held in Upington on 23-24 May 1998. The meeting included San, Nama, Griqua and revivalist groups such as CCHDC and KRC. San and Nama groups expressed their dismay over the Government’s attention to urban, better-resourced groups to the detriment of traditional, rural and poorly resourced groups.

DCD supported a process with Griqua organizations to form a joint Griqua National Forum (GNF) representing seven major organizations. There was no effective process from the Government’s side with San and Nama communities, with the result that the Government attempted to impose arbitrary decisions on who should represent communities. This confusing and highly undemocratic approach was the result of DCD’s limited staffing and resources.

On 8 March 1999, DCD held its follow-up Conference on the Constitutional Position of Communities Who View Themselves as Indigenous. With the assistance of SASI, the representation and preparation of Nama and San groups was substantially improved. DCD proposed a yearlong process of research and investigation to ensure that all stakeholders are consulted before taking the constitutional accommodation process any further. This decision is supported by the cabinet and comes with a dedicated staff. The mechanisms proposed for representation put substantial pressure on poorly organized rural communities, but at the same time they do not require Khoe and San rural communities to compete against English-speaking urban groups.

The Minister, Mohammed Valli Moosa, has declared the Government’s willingness to discuss constitutional accommodation of indigenous peoples. This marks a completely new chapter in African human and constitutional rights. At the same time it is still evident that there is some nervousness about the acceptability of the word “indigenous” to the broader majority stakeholders.

It is likely that through this process the Government will come to recognize how difficult it is for marginalized constituencies with weak civil society structures to engage effectively with their constitutional rights. This could have far-reaching implications for both the Constitution and the indigenous peoples. The fundamental premise of the UN process, that substantive equality cannot be achieved without recognizing the specific discrimination against aboriginal/tribal/indigenous populations may end up being championed by South Africa.

National education

The Department of National Education (DNE) is unaware that there are any indigenous people in South Africa. It has no policies and is unaware of the UN Decade on Indigenous Peoples. There has been no contact between DNE and PanSALB, which is responsible for this liaison. According to DNE officials, Nama may not be introduced to schools as anything but a foreign language subject, and only after approval by the Director-General and the Council of Education Ministers. The initiative by PanSALB and the Northern Cape Education Department to introduce Nama into one school in the Richtersveld is technically illegal.

Environment and tourism

The actions of mining companies in Namaqualand is of grave concern to Nama communities and yet is receiving no serious attention by the Department. Mine companies are required by law to refill and restore open pit mines once the mine is no longer in use. In practice this does not get

1 See Resolution of Conference in Appendix D.
done. The result is the ruin of the landscape, which negatively impacts on tourism potential. The
mining also destroys precious archaeological material including petroglyphs (engraved rocks).
The attitude of the mining companies is so dismissive that at one point their dump heaps almost
shut off the road to the Richtersveld National Park.

The Northern Cape province is keen to promote its Khoe and San identity. However, it has
not negotiated with communities how this is to take place considering so many of the indigenous
peoples’ basic needs are still being ignored.

Finance: SA Statistics

The Department of Finance is responsible for SA Statistics, previously known as Central
Statistics Service (CSS). SA Statistics has gone through a number of transformations since the
end of apartheid, however its ignorance and lack of policy on indigenous populations
demonstrates how deeply the bureaucracy is committed to apartheid assumptions about identity.
In 1995, CSS carried out detailed household income and expenditure surveys for each province,
including the Northern Cape (see Bibliography). None of the Northern Cape publications
acknowledge the substantial Khoe and San presence in the province. Most Khoe and San people
are either reflected under the category “coloured” or in some cases “African” and with some
questions they likely appear under “Other”. It is the subjective view of SASI that Khoe and San
people live at the bottom of the economic system in the Northern Cape. Their poverty is obscured
by being included in “coloured” statistics, which include the majority population of the province,
particularly concentrated in urban areas. According to statistics, so-called Africans are evidently
the poorest population of the province. Experience on the ground shows that Xhosa speaking
migrant labourers may earn higher incomes and have additional sources of income than local
Khoe and San residents.

Griqua groups have approached the head of SA Statistics to include them in the next census,
however, officials have been non-committal about including Nama and San as a distinct category
because of their small numbers. This is despite having included statistics on Asians in the
Northern Cape who are some 2,268 people. There is even a category of Unspecified at 12,208
(1.5 per cent of the population) which may refer to San and Khoe people though this is not
explained (CSS, 1997; Stats SA, 1998).!

Foreign affairs

DFA has been contacted by IPACC both in Geneva and in Pretoria. SASI and IPACC are
expecting to launch a lobbying project to accelerate DFA policy development in relation to the
UN Decade on Indigenous People and the Draft Declaration. DFA has a dedicated staff member
to deal with indigenous issues at the UN. DFA intends consulting with DCD before it meets with
lobbying groups. DCD is the line function department, so DFA is reliant on DCD before it can
formalize its position.

DFA is reliant on DCD to guide it on indigenous policy matters. Director General of DFA,
Jackie Selebi has stated that foreign policy will be a reflection of domestic needs and policies.
Both the South African Mission in Geneva and the Department in Pretoria have been enthusiastic
to learn more about the issue and cooperate directly with indigenous activists.

Health

The National Health Department has shown no awareness of the situation of Khoe and San
people. Khoe and San people have not been invited to participate in rural health care
programmes, particularly those involving traditional healers. On the ground, rural San people
often find clinics staff by ethnic groups who act oppressively towards them and are regularly
embarrassed or talked down to by clinic sisters. Like other rural South Africans, many Khoe and
San people have no chance of getting to clinics which can be up to 200 km from their homes. The situation is particularly acute along the Orange (!Garib) River.

Justice

The Department of Justice is obliged by the Constitution to provide interpreters and translators for speakers of Khoe and San languages. This is not available and magistrates do not appear to be aware or interested. There is an urgent need to reconsider laws pertaining to stock theft. When an extremely poor !Khomani man recently killed a goat, he was sent to prison for nine months. The laws used against San hunters are unchanged since the last century and are out of proportion to sentences for crimes such as rape and assault.

Water affairs and forestry

The Department of Water Affairs and Forestry has one of the best reputations in the Government. However, it appears to be fully unaware of the presence or needs of indigenous peoples. Recently, in an act of good will the Minister renamed the Hendrick Verwoerd Dam by a Khoe name, Gariep Dam. Unfortunately Gariep is not a Nama word but a bastardization in Afrikaans. The real name is !Garib, or Ga!Garib (great river) when referring to the original name of the Orange River. There are numerous rivers and pans that need their names corrected. Access to water remains a serious issue for most communities though the Department is making substantial progress on this issue.

Welfare

The Department of Welfare in Pretoria is unaware of the situation of indigenous peoples who are highly reliant on pension payments. SASI regularly struggles with the Upington office to ensure that payments are made to the speakers of N/u, the almost extinct language of the !Khomani San. The Upington office makes clerical errors and cuts people off. SASI found one San elder starving after not having received her pension for five months and having no other source of income. She is illiterate and could not make sense of the slip that she was given. She was told that the problem was in Pretoria and nothing could be done. Upon investigation it turned out that Upington had made the mistake and the funds were released. The local Department has been willing to correct errors but proceeds to make other arbitrary decisions that have to be followed up.
5. Economic development and cultural survival: Friends or foe?

"We thought that with our land back we would heal the culture that is the soul of our people. But we find instead that our language is dying. At least while we were in exile we were able to read and speak our language (Nama is recognized in Namibia). We now realize that, in the act of regaining our land, we may have destroyed our culture."

Willem Damarah, Nama spokesperson Riemvasmaak
(Koch et al., 1997: 281)

Most community respondents claim that they want both economic development and cultural survival. Some of the solutions to poverty being considered or enacted by indigenous communities and their support organizations may in fact weaken indigenous cultures and push people into work environments and a work ethic that undermine their cultures. While acknowledging this risk, it is necessary to recognize that all cultures are dynamic and that changes in culture can be a sign of vitality. "Cultural survival" should not mean stopping history, where cultural content is measured against an idealized lifestyle of a previous era.

In the discussions below, I attempt to draw out some considerations about the relationship between economic development and cultural survival. The first discussion looks at whether certain economic strategies marginalize or enhance cultural systems. The second discussion looks at the exploitation of culture and whether this enhances cultural institutions so that they remain dynamic or whether it reduces culture to a commodity without social meaning.

5.1. The 40-hour week versus flexible employment

According to Hennie Swarts, manager of the !Xô and Khwe development project, much of the development planning currently taking place at Schmidtsdrift and Platfontein is based on two assumptions:

1. people need to earn an income to sustain themselves;
2. people need work to keep themselves occupied and fulfilled.

Both of these assumptions appear to be warranted and shared by both the local community leadership and the craftspeople that I interviewed at Schmidtsdrift and Platfontein. However, there are some underlying assumptions about the culture of work and how people make use of their time that may need to be reconsidered and discussed by those involved.

Swarts highlighted the problem of assuming that people in the communities were interested in jobs requiring people to work 40-hour weeks. He perceives that !Xô and Khwe adults tend to prioritize personal and communities needs over their job commitments and responsibilities. It is his view that the community must overcome this approach and build up a work ethic along with a skill base for the next generation.

Though at one level, some !Xô and Khwe adults have expressed interest in securing full-time employment, in practice people have tended in the direction of contract work of a limited duration, or no real employment at all. Very few members of the community have attained employment based on a 40-hour work week. In the case of military people based at Schmidtsdrift, their work hours tend to overlap with community work and activities.

In some communities, particular informants from the Khwe community are emphasizing their need for income generation within the framework of the existing, dominant economy (e.g. jobs in Kimberley). In the case of most San and Nama people, and likely for many poorer members of Griqua communities, the dominant economy is not an easy or pleasant place to locate oneself. Owing to a number of factors, particularly the low educational levels of Khoe and San
people, they are often forced into the lowest levels of employment. The generally high level of unemployment, low wages, and the often undignified and unsatisfactory rewards of working at the bottom or on the margins of the cash economy bring as many new problems as they solve.

Communities such as the !Khomani San and Richtersveld Namas are exploring options where they can use their cultural resource base to generate income without attempting to assimilate into the dominant economy.

In March 1998, the core traditional community of the !Khomani in the southern Kalahari worked with SASI and the Department of Land Affairs on a land-use plan. During that planning process the majority of the participants stressed that they were not looking for full-time employment. Rather they wanted employment opportunities that would leave them free time or flexible time to spend hunting, gathering or with their families. A higher percentage of women than men stressed that they wanted time to be with their families gathering food and teaching skills to the younger generation.

The highest paid regular work available to men in the !Khomani community is tracking on behalf of scientific researchers in KGNP. The average pay is R200 to R250 (US$32–40) per day. This work tends to be for periods of one to two weeks a month while projects are in process. Another example is of employment with film companies, advertisers, researchers and so forth who pay the community for photo shoots. One photo shoot can bring in as much as R4,000 (US$645) and require a day or two work. This is the single largest source of income available.

The land use planning exercise gives SASI and the !Khomani community a mandate to explore the possibilities of cyclical work or job-sharing work which will provide community members with a steady income and the opportunity to participate in the traditional non-cash economy of hunting and food-gathering.

The SA National Parks (SANP) and the Nama community of Khubus (!Gupus) have explored similar options. Men participate in a field guide training course that allows them access to tourists coming to visit the Richtersveld National Park. The Nama hunter-pastoralists have sophisticated veldt skills, and receive some training from the SANP on working with tourists and handling money. The Nama guides then take tourists hiking in the veldt while explaining details of the biodiversity and culture of the area. Women have participated in building a traditional homestead of reed-mat houses where tourists can stay overnight, with the option of traditional meals.

Unlike the !Khomani or even some of the Nama people in South Africa, the !Xù and Khwe are not in a position to go back to the land for hunting and gathering purposes. However, there is a risk of colonizing the culture of work by insisting on a model of the 40-hour work week. With the global changes in working culture and work hours, the !Xù and Khwe may want to investigate types of employment that suit their own cultural preferences better, and in the end provide a better quality of life.

Evidence for this can be seen in the discussions held with Swarts about “Special Employment” which currently involves 700 men from the two Schmidtsdrift communities. Owing to the military skills developed by !Xù and Khwe men, they have access to a niche in the job market where employers are seeking people with specialized security and tracking skills. Examples of this work include investigations into cattle rustling in other provinces, working as rangers on private game farms, and working as horse jockeys. This work tends to be better paid than local unskilled or semi-skilled labour, and is of relatively short duration. These appear to be desirable qualities to those who take on the work.

The evident implications of trying to balance the need for cash with a rhythm of life that allows the community to give attention to non-cash economic and social activities are that:

1. people opting for this model cannot hold down standard jobs in the wage economy;
2. it is likely that people will earn less cash overall than their culturally dominant neighbours, unless they can insert themselves higher up the skill scale of the economy, such as in professional tracking, fine arts or elite tourism.
5.1.1. Arts versus crafts

The !Xú and Khwe Association has initiated a number of arts and crafts projects at the Schmidtsdrift and especially at the new settlement of Plattfontein. Here again we see power issues being played out between cultural expression by community people and the needs of the market combining with the pressure to alleviate poverty.

From 1994, San artists at Schmidtsdrift became reasonably renowned in South Africa for their work in oils and lino-cuts. The artist who initiated the project trained local people in new artistic methods, yet encouraged them to draw on their culture and life experience to produce fresh and exciting images. A number of women and men became recognized as the leading artists, including Flaai, João, Reciano, Carimbwe (these being their signature names). The large oil paintings are sold for as much as R1,000. Were the artists to pursue their careers and become well established in the South African art market they could expect to fetch up to R10,000 for large canvases.

Recently, the quality of the oil painting has dropped and the Plattfontein projects are putting more emphasis on craft productions.

**Bernardo Rumao**

**!Xú man, Plattfontein**

Bernardo Rumao made a name for himself when he started painting and producing lino-cuts of the violence of military life and the harsh conditions of resettlement in the tent city of Schmidtsdrift. His artwork sold better than some of the other artists, which created jealousy. Other artists resented Rumao's creativity and saw it as a threat to their own markets. The Plattfontein artists imposed informal controls on what could be produced and used social sanctions to enforce the ban on creative work with political connotations. Rumao has increased his drinking and does some work with lino-cuts. Like the others he has taken to producing pictures of sunflowers and animals that sell for less but bring in a more regular income.

Bernardo Rumao’s experience raises some pertinent issues about the relationship between work and culture. The !Xú and Khwe cultures have been severed from their material roots in Angola and Namibia. Now, in a radically different physical and economic environment !Xú and Khwe people must make decisions that will influence which elements of their old cultures survive, knowing that their cultures must go through radical changes while readjusting to the new circumstances.

The initiation of the art project was premised on the idea that people would express and grapple with their contradictions on the canvas of their works. Themes of the past and present interacted with each other. The painting was a new expression for the dynamic character of indigenous cultures under harsh circumstances. Like storytelling and fables, the paintings were a record for future generations, and an interpretation of events through an intact cultural continuity.

Owing to market forces and the emphasis on maximizing participation in income generation, individual artists have less motivation to paint. Moreover, the !Xú and the Khwe have lost an expression of their experience which would help future generations describe and cope with the turmoil of their past. The serious artwork could be more aggressively marketed to a receptive elite market, however, this works against the interest of the less skilled craftspeople.

A number of indigenous communities in South Africa are choosing to get involved in craft production as a source of income generation. For most of these groups the experience is not entirely satisfactory. Where there is a pride of culture, the quality of the crafts is high. Craftspeople ensure that items keep their original quality and form but also their meaning. For example, arrows should be usable and bone flints should be able to be used to make a real fire.
There are new products being created drawing on new media of expression. Positive examples include pottery being produced at Platfontein and textiles at Schmidtsdrift and Khubus (!Gupus). Recently, Khomani crafts persons at Kagga Kamma have started doing paintings on small rocks using traditional ochre with reed brushes. The work is attractive and sells relatively well. It opens up many issues about the rekindling of rock art traditions as part of trance dancing, a custom which the community just manages to sustain in a somewhat limited variety.

It is possible to argue that where there is greater evidence on using crafts production for income generation and poverty alleviation, it may cause the creativity and authenticity of the work to decline. This overexploitation of culture can lead to a decline in respect and value of traditional technology. This is evident with the low-grade production of other crafts by dominant cultural groups in South Africa, particularly Xhosa and Zulu craft production which demonstrates a wide range of qualities and creativity.

Currently, the national Department of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology is keen to promote craft-based cultural industries. This initiative will likely be both an opportunity and a threat to San and Nama culture. Too much emphasis on mass production can take the culture out of the products and take the self-respect away from the producers. As poverty alleviation is a serious concern then the challenge will be how to market authentic, culturally significant arts and craft at an elite consumer group, and choose other projects for mass production.

Crafts are not the only form of cultural industry under pressure. South Africa has a long tradition of cultural performance. Traditional Zulu, Xhosa, Sotho and other dances have been performed for generations in the mines, on farms and in urban areas. These have been used for entertainment, distraction and competition. They are increasingly used to service the tourism industry. There is mounting pressure on San and Nama groups to perform dances for the public, and moreover in international fora to promote tourism in South Africa.

For all San people, the trance-dance is one of their most sacred events. The concept of dancing or singing for strangers has always been associated with coercion and indignity. The government officials and development workers involved in encouraging these activities need to be made aware of the major differences of dance traditions between San people and Bantu-language communities.

Marie Farmer
50 year old Nama woman, !Gupus, Richtersveld

The Eastern Cape Department of Education, Arts and Culture is developing a Khoekhoe cultural village at Tsitsikamma National Park (TNP). Organizers would like Nama elders from the Northern Cape to teach local people at TNP (some 1,500 km to the south) to make reed-mat huts and to dance traditional Nama dances. The purpose is to create income opportunities for the local coloured community, many of whom are of Khoe descent. Marie resents the pressure that poverty is putting on Namas to market their culture. She says "My parents did not teach me our songs and our ways so I could just sell them to other people".

In contrast to the Khoekhoe village at Tsitsikamma, the WIMSA board has given a mandate to SASI to establish a cultural-tourism training centre in Cape Town involving San trainees and staff from around southern Africa. The content of the village and the way that San cultures are to be represented is part of the planning and training process. San people discuss and choose what gets presented to the outside world and how this is done. They decide what needs to be kept under the control of the community and not consumed. The profits return to San communities rather than to intermediaries.

The overall conclusion is that indigenous communities should be encouraged to talk through the implications of economic planning with their partners. Values and preferences about work and culture should inform the types of training and job creation that take place. Government
officials in particular need a proper orientation before dealing with indigenous cultures which they may not understand.

5.2. Cultural survival

UNESCO estimates that of the world's 6,000 languages, at least 3,000 are at risk of dying out. Of these, indigenous people's languages are disproportionately at risk (Wurm, 1996).

The death of languages is both an example and an indicator of cultural collapse. Language is the prime vehicle of intergenerational cultural transmission and maintenance. Languages change and adjust to new circumstances, but they also create continuity over centuries of expression. All indigenous languages in South Africa are under serious threat of extinction. Nama and Xhosa communities are acutely aware of this phenomenon. !Xô and Khwe communities are just starting to become aware of the threat.

During consultations, community representatives complain about the decreasing knowledge base between the generations. Young people struggle to name plants or animals or use environmentally sustainable technology that was commonplace to their grandparents. The loss of this knowledge and the degeneration of institutional practices that helped transmit it between generations is not a form of development but rather an impoverishment of indigenous people.

The issue of what constitutes culture is beyond the reach of this report. Suffice it to say that culture is the sum of practices, beliefs and values of a community. It includes both tangible and intangible elements including: languages, food customs, music, creative expression, values and norms, dress, architecture, oral tradition and many other areas. All cultures are dynamic and thrive on the relationship between social relations and the surrounding material conditions of a society.

That cultures change is inevitable and normal. The problem arises when a community loses the power to influence the speed and nature of the changes it is experiencing. Certain communities, particularly those that have lost their land and resource base, undergo changes that cause their fundamental social institutions to collapse and large elements of traditional knowledge and culture are lost and replaced with elements that are appropriate only for a situation of subordination and poverty.

It is a useful exercise to consider the impact of certain development strategies on the maintenance and expansion of the first language. This is not to suggest that communities should not be learning languages of power such as English and Afrikaans. Rather it is to make explicit that if development planning is actively reducing indigenous languages to a third rate status with no scope for intellectual and technical growth then this is precisely the type of cultural colonialism that will extinguish community driven growth and management of intellectual resources.

Informants for this research were divided over whether it is more important to get a job, any job, or whether quality of life and cultural maintenance take precedence over income options. I would argue that these two issues mutually influence each other. When considering the impact of work on culture and the development of new economic opportunities, indicators to consider are:

- Do certain types of employment allow people to use their first language while working or must they use a "work" language?
- Do people feel culturally comfortable in the surroundings or must their indigenous identity be set aside during work hours?
- Are indigenous people able to express their own cultural priorities at the workplace or do they have to behave like the dominant culture?
Job creation and sustainable economic strategies could use existing intellectual and cultural resources to both reinforce cultural survival and provide community people with a niche within the wage economy (even if only cyclically) at a higher, better remunerated point.

Swarts makes the painful but accurate observation that: "If you ask me if these languages will survive into the next century, I think the answer is no, unless something serious is done now."
6. Summary of solutions proposed by Nama and San indigenous peoples

6.1. Combine economic priorities with cultural resources

Overall, most San and Khoe people are probably poorer than their neighbours and have little or no control over their economic conditions. Most indigenous San and Khoe do menial labour, or survive on pension payments. Many are unemployed and unemployable.

However, the changes in the political system and new approaches to economic development that favour distribution of opportunities and eradication of poverty can and are substantially improving opportunities for Khoe and San people.

The three most important political-economic changes that have come with the transformation to democracy and which offer opportunities for both economic development and cultural survival include:

- land reform, which includes restitution and redistribution as well as economic development opportunities for rural areas. This provides a base for a series of economic activities, both traditional and wage related;
- growth in tourism, particularly environmental and cultural tourism, which is promoted by the Government and private enterprise. Indigenous cultures and bush skills have a premium value that is not being fully exploited by indigenous peoples themselves;
- a new vision of national parks where communities are seen as partners rather than as a threat to conversation. The old parks board system was responsible for dispossessing communities of critically important resources. The new policies are opening up skills training and job opportunities for communities bordering or reclaiming national parks.

Each of these has drawn the attention of indigenous communities trying to improve their current situation.

6.1.1. An indigenous development paradigm

These unique South African opportunities fit in with an overall development paradigm that has grown out of the experiences of San development projects in neighbouring Namibia and Botswana. This paradigm rests on an economic and social analysis that recognizes the following contrasting realities:

- San communities are rich in traditional knowledge that allows for sustainable exploitation and management of natural resources;
- the traditional natural resource base is being eroded or removed with tacit or explicit state approval;
- San communities that are forced off the land into the wage economy, enter it at the very bottom, in situations of extreme poverty and degradation;
- children born into situations of poverty and displacement lose traditional knowledge and become caught in a cycle of poverty and low self-esteem.

There is a tension in these competing conditions between maintaining elements of a hunter-gatherer mode of production that is no longer fully viable and trying to integrate effectively with a hostile and discriminatory economic and political system.

---

1 This section is based on Crawhall (forthcoming, 1999): Going to a better life. See also Indigenous Peoples' Consultation: Report on an Indigenous Peoples' Consultation on Empowerment, Culture and Spirituality in Community Development, Kuru Development Trust and WIMSA, 1999.
Many of the southern African San communities still place a high value on being able to walk in the bush and engage in traditional practices, yet they are faced with the need for cash to buy clothes, extra food, medicine, shelter and so forth. Without a concerted effort by the communities and NGOs, communities are being forced to abandon the traditional economy in favour of poverty. Even in cases where communities are fortunate enough to access good opportunities, the survival of culture and identity still needs to be taken into consideration.

The main strategy developed by WIMSA and its affiliates for halting the slide into misery has been to:

- retain or regain land and other natural resources where possible;
- stimulate traditional knowledge use where possible;
- where the resource base is too small, look at developing community controlled income-generating projects which, amongst other things, tap traditional knowledge to give the San an edge in the market place;
- insist on autonomy over dependence in relations with the outside world;
- organize politically to resist further marginalization and challenge discriminatory stereotyping and victimization;
- provide communities with educational and training opportunities for activists and traditional leaders.

The net result has been a growth in community-based tourism, crafts and eco-tourism ventures combined with varying degrees of hunting and wild food gathering. There is now more discussion of joint management of wildlife areas with private or parastatal agencies.

SASI and the Khomani community of the Southern Kalahari developed the following table. It provides an insight into how development can be built on combination of traditional knowledge and natural resources rights, including secure land tenure. The principles and proposed solutions can equally be applied to the Namas of the Orange (!Garib) River area and the Richtersveld.

Table 6. Major problems and proposed solutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major problems</th>
<th>Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Total land insecurity</td>
<td>- Negotiate a land claim (including wild land and residential land both inside and outside KGNP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Purchase residential plots where squatting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. No access to natural resources</td>
<td>- Negotiate access rights to KGNP, including hunting and gathering rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Secure wild land outside park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Poverty</td>
<td>- Develop viable income-generating projects that maximize existing community knowledge and lifestyle preferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Traditional knowledge dying out</td>
<td>- Conduct a cultural resource aAudit and strengthen social institutions which transmit information across generations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Develop a cultural resource and natural resource management plan to ensure sustainable development and control over resources by the community</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This model bridges the distinction that many outsiders insist on making between traditional and modern economic practices. For most San and Nama people there is no contradiction. A sufficient land and natural resource base, accompanied by the stabilization and reconstruction of local institutions (e.g. informal transgenerational education), is sufficient to give young indigenous people the option of learning skills necessary for the job market while maintaining...
access to traditional knowledge systems and natural resources that can supplement income generation.

6.2. Build institutional capacity

None of the above scenarios can be fulfilled if Nama and San people do not have institutions durable enough and skilled enough to secure these ideals. The current capacity of community structures to cope with land claims, government negotiations and joint management with national parks is inadequate. The only advances that have been made have come with a dependency on NGOs.

6.3. Include gender awareness in development

Currently, Nama and San groups have had little to say about a strategy for gender-balanced development. Most spokespersons recognized by the Government tend to be men. Typically, male agendas dominate planning and negotiations. Women have the most active involvement in issues concerning child rearing and education.

Riemvasmaak Namas have made a concerted effort to ensure that women are at the forefront of advocacy training and negotiations with the Government. The traditional Khoi community, in cooperation with SASI and DLA, has developed a technique where women form their own working groups during planning sessions to ensure that their gender specific contribution is developed and heard.

Figure 1 of the Needs Overview indicates that development planning needs to be aware of the value of women’s work or it can reinforce a process of diminishing women’s voices and power.

6.4. Promote empowerment through education

San and Khoe people are looking at two areas of increasing attainment in education. The first is to increase the absolute number of indigenous people with a reasonable secondary and tertiary level of education. This level of education is essential for accessing a number of important opportunities, such as joint management arrangements with South African National Parks and handling collective intellectual property rights.

With this first aim comes the need for greater adult literacy capacity in both Afrikaans and English. Though the immediate surrounding culture is almost exclusively Afrikaans-speaking, indigenous peoples need to be effective in their interactions with the national Government and the international domain where English is a more practical option.

The other area is gaining control over school policy and procedures so that schools become more supportive and effective for indigenous peoples. This means having direct input in the development of curriculum, particularly in languages, science and environmental studies. First language literacy is one of the major concerns expressed by all indigenous peoples.
7. Recommendations

The needs of indigenous peoples in South Africa are great, as they are for many people in Africa. South Africa's unique democratic political system and human rights based Constitution offer indigenous people a substantially better future than can be expected elsewhere on the continent. However, these opportunities can only be achieved if the State recognizes and addresses how little access indigenous people have to state services and constitutionally guaranteed rights.

Some government departments, particularly the Department of Constitutional Development and the Department of Land Affairs are already actively addressing some of the needs raised in this survey. Other issues presented here could do with greater attention. Responsible departments require support and resources to ensure that a transformation process happens timeously, constructively and efficiently.

The following are recommendations to be considered by the ILO.

7.1. Educate and train government officials

Government officials need support in transforming their service to include previously marginalized indigenous peoples. Government officials need to be informed about the cultures, history and needs of indigenous peoples so that they can effectively address those needs that are currently being ignored.

This education process should be informed by both local and international experience. The most useful starting point is direct dialogue between state officials and indigenous South Africans. There are also important parallels and lessons to be learned from countries such as Canada, India, Brazil and Norway amongst others. Where possible SA government officials should be encouraged to enter into dialogue about policy development with their counterparts in other countries and with representatives of international indigenous movements. This international component is particularly important due to the significance of South Africa's role in the Southern African Development Conference (SADC) and the United Nations. The development of a domestic policy on indigenous affairs cannot ignore the foreign policy implications and challenges.

7.2. Monitor inter-governmental cooperation and policy coherence

There needs to be ongoing monitoring of the development of coherent policies and practices by government departments. Though it helps to record the violations of constitutional rights, it is more effective to concentrate on sharing positive examples of transforming and improving services.

The nascent inter-departmental working group on indigenous issues (DCD, DFA and DACST) should be supported and later expanded to include other national and provincial departments. This working group should be assisted by ILO to identify and monitor its own goals and progress.

An annual report should be produced on the State's progress in addressing the needs of indigenous peoples.

The working group should be gender aware so as to monitor the impact on gender relations of increased government involvement in indigenous people's economic and social development.
7.3. Advocate for a statistical baseline

The absence of comparative statistics is a very serious omission. This issue should be raised with Statistics South Africa for immediate correction. A household survey, similar to that conducted in 1995 should be conducted in areas of dense indigenous population. This would create a baseline that would allow government departments to make decisions about the relative needs of indigenous constituencies. It would also create a baseline for monitoring changes. Financial assistance for this project might be available through the United Nations, the ILO, or a major development agency.

Details of indigenous people’s languages and identities should be included in the 2001 census questions. Statistics SA should be made to understand the international significance of monitoring the vitality of indigenous cultures and languages.

7.4. Build institutional capacity

Serious attention needs to be given to supporting the development of institutional capacity amongst indigenous peoples in rural areas. Though all indigenous peoples have this common need, it is most acute amongst Nama, Griqua and //Xegwi San where there are no community based structures to represent them (for example in Upington, Olifantshoek, Kuruman, Lothair).

This project will require the cooperation of the Government, non-governmental organizations and communities.

7.5. Promote international dialogue on economic development and cultural survival

The ILO is in a unique position to open an international dialogue about the relationship between work, culture and economic development. In the rapidly changing global economic environment and with the evident threat to indigenous languages and cultures, the issue of identifying income generating projects for indigenous peoples that enhance their cultures needs to be explored, discussed and promoted.

Owing to the differences in context between north and south, ILO should help indigenous people of Africa, Asia and Latin America share their perspectives on these serious issues of poverty and cultural sustainability.

A related and very important issue is the role of national parks and conservation areas in promoting or undermining indigenous knowledge systems and economic opportunities for indigenous peoples. Conservation in Africa is typified by the exclusion of indigenous peoples, particularly hunter-gatherers from conservation areas (see IIED, 1994). South Africa and Namibia are offering some radical new approaches that can serve as models to other countries.
Appendix A

Interviewees and consultations

Individual interviews conducted with:
- Maria Farmer, Nama community spokesperson, Northern Cape
- Dawid Kruiper, tKhomani leader, Northern Cape
- Cecil LeFleur, Griqua leader, Western Cape
- Mario Mahongo !Xù leader, Northern Cape
- Riette Mierke, on !Xù and Khwe arts and crafts project, Northern Cape
- Frans Prins, on //Xegwi community of Mpumalanga
- /Guna Rooi, Saasi elder, Northern Cape
- Kujanda Sikamba, Khwe artist, Northern Cape
- William Springbok, Saasi elder, Northern Cape
- Conrad Steenkamp, on !Kung community of Botswana
- Hennie Swarts, on !Xù and Khwe communities of Northern Cape
- Petrus Vaalbooi, tKhomani leader, Northern Cape

Consultation on basic needs of tKhomani families at Kagga Kamma, Cedarberg, Western Cape, 4 January 1999 with: Klaas Kabys Kruiper, Betty Kruiper, Sana /Ginas Kruiper, Ping Kruiper, Jan Kruiper, Hendrick Buks Kruiper, Fytjie Kruiper.

Intellectual property rights and indigenous involvement in archaeological sites workshop and preparation for participation in World Archaeological Conference 4, Cape Town, 11 January 1999
- Willem Damarah and Lillian Damarah, Nama Cultural Committee, Riemvasmaak
- Petrus Vaalbooi, tKhomani Association, Rietfontein, Southern Kalahari

Preparatory Workshops for participation in constitutional development negotiation process (including traditional leadership issues).
- 30 !Xù and Khwe Association members at Schmidtsdrift, 2 March 1999
- 3 !Xù, 2 Khwe, 9 Nama, 7 tKhomani elected representatives at Upington, 6 March 1999
Appendix B

Some comparative education indicators

In this Appendix, I have attempted to contrast some of the statistics gathered by Archer (Participatory Research, 1995) and those available from Statistics SA for the Northern Cape. These do not give an accurate picture of the overall situation of indigenous peoples as the !Xô and Khwe have a unique relationship with the military that influences their resource base. Nonetheless it gives some sense of the relative marginalization of indigenous people.

The Northern Cape is characterized by its low population density. It has one-third of South Africa’s landmass, and only 2 per cent of the population.

With a life expectancy calculated at 62.7 years, the inhabitants of the Northern Cape have the third highest life expectancy of all the provinces. This is based on the Human Development Index, calculated by CSS for South Africa and its provinces for the years 1980 and 1991. ... (from CSS, 1998).

1. Literacy levels

1.1. Provincial average

The index also indicates an adult literacy rate of 80 per cent for Northern Cape in 1991 compared with 82 per cent for the entire country. On the relative ranking of the HDI, Northern Cape compares well with countries such as Mexico and Romania (from CSS, 1998).

1.2. Literacy at Schmidtsdrift (from participatory research, 1995)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Other languages* — all adults</th>
<th>Speak</th>
<th>Read</th>
<th>Write</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>783</td>
<td>549</td>
<td>511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portuguese</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tswana</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1 242</td>
<td>752</td>
<td>686</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Excluding home language which is not written.

1.3 Literacy comparison

With a provincial average of 80 per cent literacy, San at Schmidtsdrift have a written literacy level of 41 per cent in their second language and 0 per cent in their home language.

2. Education levels

2.1. Provincial average

Education levels in the Northern Cape are generally rather low. Approximately 79 per cent of the entire adult population (aged 20 years and older) of Northern Cape did not have Standard 10 in 1995. Of this proportion, approximately 93 per cent were coloured or African.

Among all those aged 20 years or more in Northern Cape, both Africans and coloured people tend to be poorly educated. For example, 23 per cent of Africans and coloured people, or almost one in every four, had no formal education at all.
### 2.2 Education levels at Schmidtsdrift

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualifications — all adults</th>
<th>IXU</th>
<th>Khwe</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>529</td>
<td>278</td>
<td>807</td>
<td>62.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School</td>
<td>305</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>471</td>
<td>36.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>838</td>
<td>449</td>
<td>1287</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2.3 Education comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualifications — all adults</th>
<th>IXU and Khwe (%)</th>
<th>Provincial average (African and coloured) (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>62.7</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School</td>
<td>36.6</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix C

Estimated numbers of Khoe and San language speakers in South Africa

- partial Xhosa & !Kokwa: 10
- N/u or = Khomani: 20
- Nam-speaking San: 400
- Khwedaman: 1000
- !Xu: 3000
- Khoekhoegowap (Nama): 6000
Appendix D

Resolution: Conference held on 23 and 24 May 1998

RECOGNIZING that South Africa is committed to addressing all the issues relating to indigenous peoples;

ACCEPTING the need to give full effect to the provisions of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 dealing with equality, rights of citizens, the development of all official languages including the Khoi, Nama and San languages, human dignity, language and culture, the rights of cultural and linguistic communities and also empowerment;

NOTING the solid foundations laid towards the advancement of these rights at a conference held in Upington on 23 and 24 May 1998, and attended by representatives of the Nama, Koranna, San and the National Griqua Forum, representatives of the South Africa Government, the International Labour Organization and other interested parties;

NOTING that the issues raised and discussed at the conference, viz. language, education, culture, marriages, poverty, development, land, minerals, traditional leadership, communication, job creation and the recordal of history, amongst others, require to be dealt with further in consultation with a number of other departments and institutions and also require detailed research;

NOTING the resolve of the respective communities to determine their own destination whilst working hand in hand with the Government; and

COMMITTED to addressing the issues raised at the Conference and dealing with them to finality, we resolve to:

(a) ensure that adequate steps are taken to ensure that the Nama, Koranna, San, Griqua and Khoi communities assume their rightful role and place as citizens of the Republic of South Africa;

(b) address the aspirations of these indigenous communities, taking into account the Constitution, international instruments and practice and other instruments;

(c) continue to have dialogue on these matters, individually and collectively; as communities, and also with the Government;

(d) explore the establishment of structures or a single structure to address the needs and interests of the indigenous communities represented at this Conference;

(e) create a task team which will prepare for the next conference which must be held within three months from today;

(f) ensure that all the affected communities do participate at the next conference, including those not present today; and

(g) continue to support the Masakhane Campaign and nation-building.

(Put to Conference on 24 May 1998)

(NB — date of next conference depends on progress made by task group.)
Images of contemporary San Life

Informal housing with zinc sheets and canvas, Olifantshoek, Northern Cape (N. Crawhall)

Jacob Malgas demonstrating dying art of bow and arrow hunting, Welkom, No Cape (S. Robbins)
!Xù and Khwe Arts and Crafts Project, Plattfontein, Northern Cape (N. Crawhall)

Jan Kruiper works with new artistic medium using old technology, ochre painting on rocks, Kagga Kamma, Western Cape (N. Crawhall)
Research bibliography


Bohannan, P.; Curtin, P. 1971. Africa and Africans (Garden City, New York, Natural History Press).


---. 1998. "Living in Northern Cape: Selected findings of the 1995 October household survey" (Kimberley, CSS).

See also statistics South Africa


